

# BREAKING POINTS IN SUBGROUP LATTICES

GRIGORE CALUGAREANU AND MARIAN DEACONESCU<sup>1</sup>

Department of Mathematics and Computer Science, Kuwait University, P.O. Box 5969, Safat 13060, Kuwait

*Dedicated to R.R. Khazal*

## Abstract

The paper classifies those locally finite groups having a proper nontrivial subgroup which is comparable with any other element of the subgroup lattice.

## 1 Introduction

Let  $G$  be a group and let  $L(G)$  denote its subgroup lattice. The description of groups  $G$  with  $L(G)$  a chain is well-known. In a chain, every element is comparable with the others. This raises the natural question of seeing what can be said about groups  $G$  having a proper nontrivial subgroup  $H$  with the property that for every subgroup  $X$  of  $G$  one has either  $X \leq H$  or  $H \leq X$ . Such a subgroup  $H$  will be called a *breaking point* for the lattice  $L(G)$ . For the sake of convenience, we shall call these groups BP-groups.

Of course, BP-groups cannot be decomposed as nontrivial direct products. Moreover, if  $G$  is a BP-group with breaking point  $H$ , then every subgroup  $K$  of  $G$  strictly containing  $H$  is itself a BP-group with breaking point  $H$ . These simple considerations are valuable in what follows and we shall use them without any further reference.

Standard results from abelian group theory dispose of the structure of abelian BP-groups: these are cyclic  $p$ -groups in the finite case and Prüfer  $p$ -groups  $Z(p^\infty)$  in the infinite case. This focuses the discussion on nonabelian BP-groups.

As more exotic examples, the so-called extended Tarski groups, see Ol'shanskii [3], p. 344 are also BP-groups. If  $G$  is one of these groups, the largest breaking point is  $Z(G)$ , which is a finite cyclic  $p$ -group ( $p$  is a rather large prime) and  $G/Z(G)$  is an infinite simple  $p$ -group of exponent  $p$  (a Tarski group). These (quasi finite) examples show that BP-groups need not be soluble, nor locally finite; the class of BP-groups is thus large enough to warrant a more serious investigation.

We shall restrict ourselves here to the particular case of locally finite BP-groups; the cyclic  $p$ -groups of order at least  $p^2$  and the generalized quaternion groups are examples of finite BP-groups. As we have seen, the Prüfer  $p$ -groups exhaust the infinite abelian BP-groups - these groups are also locally finite. But there also exist infinite nonabelian locally finite BP-groups, as for example Szele's group  $S$  discussed in [2] and [6]:  $S = A\langle x \rangle$ , where  $A$  is a Prüfer 2-group and  $x$  has order

---

<sup>1</sup>The second named author wishes to thank Kuwait University for financial support through research contract SM09/00.

four,  $x^2$  is the unique element of order two of  $A$  and  $x$  acts on the normal subgroup  $A$  by inverting all elements of  $A$ .

The main result of this note shows that the examples described above exhaust all locally finite BP-groups:

**Theorem 1.1** *A locally finite BP-group is isomorphic to one of the following groups: finite cyclic  $p$ -groups of order at least  $p^2$ , generalized quaternion groups, Prüfer groups  $Z(p^\infty)$  and Szele's group  $S$ .*

The notation is standard and the proofs are elementary.

## 2 The proof of the Theorem

We need first some general information on BP-groups.

**Lemma 2.1** *Let  $G$  denote a nonabelian BP-group. Then:*

- 1)  $G$  is a  $p$ -group for some prime  $p$  and if  $H$  is a breaking point of  $L(G)$ , then  $H$  is a finite cyclic group contained in  $Z(G)$ . In particular,  $G$  has a unique subgroup of order  $p$ .
- 2)  $Z(G)$  is the largest breaking point of  $L(G)$ .
- 3) If  $G$  is infinite, a proper infinite abelian subgroup  $A$  of  $G$  has finite index if and only if  $A$  is normal in  $G$ .
- 4) If  $G$  is infinite and if  $p$  is odd, then a proper infinite abelian subgroup  $A$  of  $G$  has infinite index if and only if  $A = N_G(A)$ .

**Proof** 1) Note first that if  $H$  is a breaking point for  $L(G)$  and if  $g \in G \setminus H$ , then  $H$  is a proper subgroup of  $\langle g \rangle$ , whence  $H$  is cyclic and central.

We prove next that  $H$  is finite. If  $g \in G \setminus H$ , then  $H = \langle h \rangle < \langle g \rangle$ , so we can write  $h = g^a$  for some integer  $a$  with  $|a| \geq 2$ . Apply the same argument to the element  $hg = g^{a+1} \in G \setminus H$  to obtain  $h = g^{(a+1)b}$  for some integer  $b$  with  $|b| \geq 2$ .

Suppose now that  $H$  is infinite. Then both  $\langle g \rangle$  and  $\langle hg \rangle = \langle g^{(a+1)} \rangle$  are infinite and  $g^a = h = g^{(a+1)b}$ . One must have  $a = (a+1)b$ , for otherwise  $g$  would have finite order, a contradiction. Elementary divisibility arguments force  $a = -2$  and  $b = 2$ , thus  $h = g^{-2}$ . The above argument, applied to the element  $g^{-1} \in G \setminus H$ , gives  $h = g^2$ , whence the equality  $g^2 = h = g^{-2}$ , forcing  $g^4 = 1$ , another contradiction.

We are now ready to show that  $G$  is a  $p$ -group. To prove this, we show first that  $G$  is periodic. If  $g \in G \setminus H$  would be of infinite order, then  $\langle g \rangle$  would contain a nontrivial finite subgroup, namely  $H = \langle h \rangle$ , a contradiction. Thus  $G$  is periodic indeed. If  $g \in G \setminus H$ , then the finite cyclic group  $\langle g \rangle$  is a BP-group with breaking point  $H$ ; thus  $\langle g \rangle$  is indecomposable, forcing  $\langle g \rangle$  to be a  $p$ -group for some prime  $p$ . This implies at once that  $G$  is a  $p$ -group. In particular,  $H$  is a finite cyclic  $p$ -group and  $G$  has a unique subgroup of order  $p$ . This concludes the proof of 1).

2) Suppose that  $Z(G)$  is not a breaking point for  $L(G)$ . Then there exists some  $x \in G \setminus Z(G)$  such that  $Z(G) \not\subseteq \langle x \rangle$ . The abelian group  $K = Z(G)\langle x \rangle$  is not cyclic, nor a Prüfer group, which contradicts the fact that it must have a unique

subgroup of order  $p$ . Thus  $Z(G)$  is a breaking point for  $L(G)$ . The maximality of  $Z(G)$  follows from 1).

3) Let  $A$  be an infinite abelian subgroup of  $G$ . Note that  $A$  is not normal in  $G$  if and only if  $core_G(A)$  is a proper subgroup of  $A$  if and only if  $core_G(A)$  is finite - these follow from  $A$  being a Prüfer group. Also note that if  $A$  has finite index in  $G$ , then  $core_G(A)$  has finite index in  $G$ . Thus  $A$  being not normal in  $G$  and having finite index are contradictory.

4) Let  $A$  be an infinite proper subgroup of  $G$ , so that  $A$  is a Prüfer  $p$ -group. Then  $A$  is a maximal abelian subgroup of  $G$  (for otherwise one would find a larger Prüfer subgroup  $B$  containing  $A$ , which is impossible), so  $A = C_G(A)$ . Now  $N_G(A)/A$  is isomorphic to a subgroup of  $Aut(A)$  and by 1) this factor group is periodic. This forces  $N_G(A) = A$  since if  $p$  is odd  $Aut(A)$  has no nontrivial elements of  $p$ -power order. This completes the proof of the Lemma. □

We are now in a position to give a proof of the Theorem.

**Proof** Let  $G$  be a locally finite BP-group. If  $G$  is finite, then either  $G$  is cyclic, or  $p = 2$  and  $G$  is a generalized quaternion group. This follows from the lemma and from Satz 8.2, p. 310 of Huppert [1]. If  $G$  is infinite, then any two nontrivial elements of  $G$  generate a finite subgroup  $T$  of  $G$  which has just one minimal subgroup. For  $p$  odd, this subgroup  $T$  is cyclic. Thus  $G$  is abelian, which implies at once that  $G \cong Z(p^\infty)$ .

We reached the stage where all locally finite BP-groups were classified, except those which are infinite nonabelian 2-groups. From now on,  $G$  will denote a locally finite infinite nonabelian BP-group which is a 2-group.

Since  $G$  is nonabelian, there exists a pair of non commuting elements in  $G$  which generate a nonabelian subgroup  $K$  of  $G$ , which is a generalized quaternion 2-group. Thus, if  $X$  is any finite subset of  $G$ , then  $X$  is contained in the subgroup  $L = \langle X, K \rangle$ , which is also a generalized quaternion group. These groups are discussed in [2], p. 48, where it is proved that the unique such locally generalized quaternion group is actually Szele's group  $S$  described in the introduction. This concludes the proof of the Theorem. □

### 3 Final remarks

1) Using our Theorem and Theorem 2.4.16 of Schmidt [4], it is easy to prove that if an infinite nonabelian BP-group  $G$  has modular lattice  $L(G)$ , then  $G$  must be an extended Tarski group.

2) The Theorem implies that for an infinite BP-group  $G$  the following are equivalent: a)  $G$  is a Černikov group; b)  $G$  is locally finite; c)  $G$  is locally nilpotent; d)  $G$  is locally soluble.

3) By parts 2) and 1) of the Lemma, it follows that if  $G$  is a nonabelian BP-group, then there are only finitely many breaking points in  $L(G)$ . Therefore, if the subgroup lattice of a group has infinitely many breaking points, then the group must be a Prüfer  $p$ -group.

4) After a preliminary version of this note was written, the authors received a reprint of Prof. R. Schmidt's recent paper [5]. In Satz 3.1 of [5], it is shown that odd order  $p$ -groups are BP-groups precisely when there exist a so-called supermodular subgroup of  $G$  (which is a breaking point of  $L(G)$ ). It is also shown there (for such infinite nonabelian  $p$ -groups of odd order) that  $Z(G)$  is the largest breaking point of  $L(G)$ . A number of interesting questions remain still open:

- a) Are there infinite BP-groups which are not locally finite and with non modular lattice  $L(G)$ ?
- b) Are there infinite BP-groups of infinite exponent which are not locally finite? Such groups would necessarily have infinite proper abelian subgroups of infinite index.

Prof A. Yu. Ol'shanskii, in a personal communication, kindly pointed out that the construction of such groups would be possible, but not very simple. This hints that a complete classification of BP-groups is far from being an easy task.

## References

- [1] B. Huppert, *Endliche Gruppen I*, Springer-Verlag, 1967.
- [2] O.H. Kegel and B.A.F. Wehrfritz, *Locally finite groups*, North Holland 1974.
- [3] A. Yu. Ol'shanskii, *Geometry of defining relations in groups*, Kluwer Academic Publishers, 1991.
- [4] R. Schmidt, *Subgroup Lattices of Groups*, Walter de Gruyter, 1994.
- [5] R. Schmidt, "Supermodulare Untergruppen von Gruppen", *Math. Kolloq.* **53** (1999) 23-49. (German)
- [6] T. Szele, "Die unendliche Quaternionengruppe", *Bul. St. Acad. Republ. Popul. Romane* vol A 1 (1949) 791-802. (German)